Readiness and Understanding of Tourism Industries in The Development of Halal Tourism in Aceh Province

Eddy Gunawan Universitas Syiah Kuala Banda Aceh

Sartiyah

Universitas Syiah Kuala Banda Aceh sartysabang@unsyiah.ac.id

Nur Aidar

Universitas Syiah Kuala Banda Aceh

Abstract

Halal tourism development requires readiness in various factors such as access, communication, environment, and services. The research was carried out in three district Aceh Province, namely in Banda Aceh City, Aceh Besar District, and Sabang City as tourism base areas. This research sample as many as 50 hotel business actors, 50 culinary delights, and 26 tourist objects, a total of 126 tourism business actors. Data analysis uses Binner Logit Regression, to determine the opportunities for tourism actors ready and not ready for halal tourism in the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province. The results showed that Accessibility, Communication, and Services had a positive effect on halal tourism in Aceh Province. Of all the factors, only services in tourism have high readiness and opportunities in influencing the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province.

Keywords: Halal Tourism, Access, Communication, Environment, and Services.

A. Introduction

In 2013 the Government of Aceh stipulated Qanun No. 8 on Tourism in Article 2 states that the implementation of tourism in Aceh based on a. faith and Islam; b. convenience; c. justice; d. populist; e. togetherness; f. sustainability; g. openness; and h. customs, culture, and local wisdom. The Qanun stipulation includes strengthening support for tourism actors in realizing halal tourism so that they can provide the best services for tourists who need Islamic tourism services. Indonesia in 2019 received achievements at the international level with being ranked first as a world halal tourist destination according to the GMTI (Global Muslim Travel Index). Aceh Province also being the 2nd level of the TOP 5 best halal travel destinations based on the Indonesian Muslim Travel Index (IMTI) after successfully getting an award as a world halal tourist destination in 2016. This award has encouraged the Aceh Government to develop halal tourism. Various efforts and

Submitted	: 19-10-2020
Accepted	: 30-11-2020
Published	: 29-12-2020

infrastructure and public services for tourist areas continue to be improved (Ministry of Information, 2020).

In dealing with these conditions, strategy and communication are needed to build the attention and concern of stakeholders, stakeholders involved, especially communities that play a role in developing the tourism industry. For this reason, the Provincial Government of Aceh is developing in the tourism sector with its spending continuing to increase. Based on data from the Ministry of Finance (2019), in 2014, government spending in the tourism sector was Rp. 60.515 billion to Rp. 266.637 billion in 2019. This expenditure increased significantly, indicating the commitment of the Aceh Regional Government in developing the tourism sector.

Behind the opportunities that Aceh has, some problems become obstacles in preparing Aceh as a halal tourist destination. Awareness and the attention of stakeholders to develop halal tourism is still limited. This can be seen from the enormous potential of halal tourism in Aceh. However, the knowledge and insights into tourism concepts and principles have not been prevalent, both among local governments and industry players. Another obstacle is tourism products, namely the culinary business in Aceh, which tends to become halal by itself or halal 'by default' because most of the population is Muslim. As a result, there is a feeling of security and a less critical attitude towards the halal and tayyib aspects of the products he consumes (Hasan, 2016). The community's readiness and concern in providing and serving halal food plays an essential role in the Muslim tourism process.

B. Literature Review

Tourism is a travelling or recreational activity and can be a foreign exchange for the visited area. Islam regulates procedures for carrying out various purposes such as seeking peace and pleasure that will produce tourism so that all activities during the tourism period can be by the Shari'a and uphold the protection of religion, life, thoughts, and others (Battour et al., 2010). Jayathilake (2013) and Kadir & Karim (2012) states that the tourism sector has become one of the crucial contributions to economic growth and contributes to economic growth in developing and developed countries. Its contribution mainly through channels, namely foreign exchange income, investment, increased tax revenue, and jobs creation. The Ministry of Tourism (2019) stated that foreign exchange obtained from the Indonesian tourism sector in 2018 reached \$19.29 billion, almost reaching the target of \$20 billion. December 2019 totalled 1.3 million visits or decreased by 2.03 per cent compared to December 2018, which totalled 1.4 million visits. Many tourists can show the potential for Muslim tourists and require Islamic tourism services, namely halal tourism.

The description of the development of tourist visits, mainly Muslims from various Islamic countries, is an ample opportunity to develop the tourism industry, namely halal tourism in Indonesia. (Battour & Ismail, 2015) state that halal tourism follows Islamic rules and laws to determine tourism products and services, such as hotels, food, attractions, and the tour itself. This halal tourism does not always aim for religious travel. The location of tourist activities is not limited to tourist objects or actions that meet Islamic law provisions. Halal tourism is not developed only in Muslim countries or regions, but also in countries or regions where most of the population is non-Muslim.

In halal tourism, accommodation, attractions and tourist objects must be developed based on Islamic rules and laws. A country or region must follow the provisions of the assessment of four GMTI factors, namely: accessibility, communication, environment, and service. The assessment of these four main aspects will automatically determine the Top 5 priority halal tourist destinations for Indonesia in Southeast Asia (Keminfo, 2019).

In preparing Aceh for halal tourism destinations, halal tourism concepts and prospects need to be communicated to the relevant stakeholders. One form of awareness problem can be found that there is a difference in hotel standardization based on halal tourism. Hotel industry players do not necessarily have awareness and are not too familiar with the concept of halal or Muslim friendly to experience difficulties in the process. Based on this description, it is necessary to look more closely at the actors' readiness in the tourism industry in developing halal tourism comprehensively in Aceh Province. The purpose of this research is to analyze: understanding and readiness of tourism industry players for the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province.

C. Research Methodology

The object of this research is the tourism industry players spread over three districts, namely Banda Aceh, Aceh Besar, and Sabang. This study's population were all tourism industry players, who were involved in tourism services, namely hotels, culinary businesses, and tourist objects.

The sample is part of the population whose characteristics we want to test (Suliyanto, 2009). In this study, the selected sample uses purposive sampling technique. The sample selected is a sample of the tourism industry players: hotels, culinary delights, and tourist objects involved in serving tourist activities. According to Sugiyono (2013), purposive sampling is a technique for determining research samples with specific considerations that aim to make the data obtained more representative.

According to Darmawan (2013), the population is more significant than 100; then the sample is at least 10 per cent. The number of hotels in the research location, there were 197 hotels, while culinary and tourist objects are not accurately recorded. The sample in each group can be determined by 50 units. Due to the condition of tourism objects being affected by COVID 19, were obtained only 126 samples. The number of samples is still following the sampling requirements. The data were obtained through questionnaires to interview the actors and owners of hotels, culinary delight, and managers of tourist objects involved in tourism activities.

In this study, the scale used was a Likert scale with intervals of 1-5. The Likert scale aims to interpret how strongly the subject agrees and disagrees with the questionnaire's statements (Sekaran&Bougie, 2016). All data from the questions on the questionnaire will be measured on a Likert scale with the value distribution mechanism used: Strongly Disagree (score 1); Disagree (2); Agree (3); Agree (4), and Strongly Agree (5). Some essential variables are needed to explain the concepts, indicators, units of measure, and measurement scale that will be understood in the operationalization of variables. Apart from these functions, the purpose of making the variables is to facilitate understanding and avoid differences of opinion in this study (Sekaran&Bougie, 2017). The variables in this study are as follows:

- Halal Tourism Readiness (HTR): Readiness in carrying out halal tourism (understand and ready for halal tourism), Nominal (Ready for Halal tourism = 1; Not ready for Halal tourism = 0).
- 2. Access (ACS): a means that connects tourists with tourist objects in the form of means of transportation or access to information, with indicators, transportation, ease of location, travel comfort, road conditions (Likert scale 1-5).

- 3. Communication (COM): communication that makes it easy for tourists to get information and send information quickly and precisely (Likert scale 1-5).
- 4. Environment (ENV): Environmental conditions, Islamic community culture, and local uniqueness that support halal tourism regarding tourist objects, (Likert scale 1-5).
- 5. Services (SER): Services of various facilities based on Islamic law to support halal tourism (Likert scale 1-5).

The analysis method used is descriptive and inferential qualitative and quantitative methods. Information obtained through interviews and questionnaires to explain the understanding and readiness of tourism actors in Aceh Province. It refers to the achievement of the application of halal tourism following the four-factor assessment provisions of the Global Muslim Travel Index (GMTI), namely: accessibility, communication, environment (environment) and service (service). Quantitatively, the analysis to answer the research objectives of readiness and understanding of halal tourism application uses primary data. Therefore, it is necessary to test the validity and reliability of the primary data. The model used is the Binner Logit Equation approach.

In analyzing the data, testing was carried out in validity and reliability tests on the model used. Validity is a measure of the high degree of validity of the data. The validity test aims to measure whether or not a statement item is valid. Whether an item is valid or not by comparing the value of r-count with r-table, the data is valid if r-count is greater than r-table. Reliability is the degree of constancy, precision, or accuracy shown by the measurement instrument. To test the reliability using Cronbach's Alpa coefficient. A reliable variable if the Cronbach Alpha (I) value is above 0.70 (Gujarati, 2012).

The classical assumption test is used so that the regression model used is precise and significant. A research model is said to be fair and can predict if it passes a series of classical assumption tests, namely: Normality Test, Mullticoinierity Test, and Heteroscedasticity Test.

The normality test is measured using the Probability Plot (P-Plot) statistical test, and the Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test Statistic is more significant than 0.05. The multicollinearity test is measured using the coefficient, the tolerance column, and the variance inflated factors. Tolerance values smaller than 0.10 and VIF more outstanding than 10 indicates that the independent variable has the opposite correlation if the value exceeds that number, the variables are free from multicollinearity (Ghozali, 2013). To test the presence or absence of heteroscedasticity, the Rank Spearman test is used, namely by correlating the independent variable to the absolute value of the residual (error). Suppose the probability of the correlation result is more significant than 0.50. In that case, there is no heteroscedasticity, and vice versa if the probability of the correlation result is smaller than 0.50, there will be heteroscedasticity (Gujarati, 2012).

Evaluating the respondents 'answers to the variables of access, communication, environment, and service as independent variables, it is necessary to categorize the variables that aim to interpret the respondents' answers. Sugiyono (2013) states that regression is one of the statistical models used to analyze the relationship between the independent variable and the qualitative dependent variable. The dependent variable category can consist of two possible values such as yes or no and from more than two categories, such as strongly disagree, disagree, agree, and strongly agree. The binary logistic regression model equation is formulated as follows:

Logit (P / 1-p)= 🛛 + 🗛 1X1i + 🗠 2X2i + 🖾 3X3i + 🖾 4X4i + ei

Where p is the probability that Y is equal to 1, and X1i, X2i, X3i, and X4i are independent variables, and li is the estimated regression coefficient. Logistic regression will

form a predictor / response variable (log (p / (1-p)), which is a linear combination of independent variables. The value of this predictor variable is then changed to probability using a logistic function, so the logistic model in this study is as follows:

Logit (p/1-p) = HTRi =µ0 + µ1ACSi + µ2COMi + µ3ENVi + µ4SERi +ei

Where HTRi is a readiness in running halal tourism (ready for halal tourism = 1; not ready for halal tourism = 0), μ 0 is a constant, μ 1, μ 2, μ 3, and μ 4 are the regression coefficients for ACSi, COMi, ENVi, and SERi. ACSi is accessed, COMi is communication, ENVi is the environment, SERi is service, and ei is the error term.

The regression model's feasibility can be measured using the Hosmer and Lemeshow's Goodness of Fit Test. If the statistical value of Hosmer and Lemeshow's Goodness of Fit Test is more significant than 0.05, the model can predict its observation value. In other words, the model is accepted because it matches the observation data (Ghozali, 2011). Furthermore, Cox and Snell's R Square are measures that try to mimic the R Square measure for multiple regression (Ghozali: 2013).

To see the independent variable's effect simultaneously on the dependent variable as in the F test in linear regression, an Overall Model Fit Test is performed based on a statistical value of -2 Log Likelihood. According to Widarjono (2010), testing can be done by comparing the value of -2 Log-Likelihood (called Chi-Square count). The calculated Chi-Square value is greater than the Chi-Square table value, or the significance value is smaller than alpha, so there is a simultaneous influence between variables. Partial test using the Wald Test is done by comparing the Wald Statistical Value with the Chi-Square comparison value at the degree of freedom (df) = 1 with alpha 5%, or by comparing the significance value (p-value) with alpha 1%, 5% and 10 %, (Ghozali: 2013).

D. Discussion

The respondents were mostly men as much as 66.7 percent and women 33.3 percent. Female respondents generally run culinary businesses, while the owners of hotels and tourist attractions are men. During the COVID 19 pandemic, the tourism industry experienced a decline in business, due to a sharp decrease in tourist visits. There no foreign tourists visited the area during the COVID 19 pandemic. In contrast, domestic tourists were only visits for business purposes, due to the local government's lockdown policy in Aceh Province. This resulted in a substantial decrease in income and labour unemployment in this sector.

They were testing the quality of the data to find out whether the instrument compiled is good. A good instrument must meet two testing requirements, namely validity and reliability tests. The validity test shows that all independent variables, namely access, communication, environment, and services, have a correlation value of r-count> r-table. It can be concluded that each question item for all variables is declared valid, which is indicated by the value R-count > 0.175.

The reliability test shows the validity of the data used can be trusted or meet the reliability aspect for further analysis. The data reliability test results for all independent variable statement items are the access of 0.854, communication of 0.850, environment of 0.830, and service of 0.894. Each item statement for all independent variables is reliable because Cronbach's Alpha value is more than 0.60. These results indicate that the data of all variables in this study deserve further analysis.

The Normality Test results show that the data are typically distributed and lead to customary conditions and are located following the normality line's increase. The Kolmogorov-Smirnov Test Statistic of 0.073 are more significant than 0.05, and these results indicate that the research data is usually distributed. VIF (Variance Inflation Factor)

value and tolerance value. The Tolerance value of the Access, Communication, Environment, Service variable ranges from 0.765 to 0.830 greater than 0.10. The Variance Inflation Factor value between 1.250 to 1.308 less than 10 indicates that all observations are worth studying and analyzing because they do not experience multicollinearity. Furthermore, Spearman's Rho value of tourism activities on the Variable Access, Communication, Environment, Service ranges from 0.212 to 0.510 indicating greater than 0.05, which means that all these variables do not experience heteroscedasticity.

Perceptions of access, halal tourism in Aceh Province explained that perceptions of access to tourist areas are quite good, namely in getting access to air transportation to tourist areas. The lowest is in providing events that increase entertainment's spirituality, like Islamic music life, meaning that in tourism locations lack entertainment facilities even though the music is Islamic in nuance. The best perception of the ease of accessing the tourist attraction facilities, while the less good when informing halal hotel and restaurant businesses was only verbally. Perception in communication is also quite good

Business actors' perceptions of the tourism environment are categorized as useful. In the community's cultural culture in the tourist destination, it is sufficient to support halal tourism. The lowest is the lack of Muslim tourists' visits to tourist destinations and the lack of available information service centres. The perception of business actors that tourism services show perfect conditions, the best is the availability of comfortable and clean worship facilities, but what is still lacking is the provision of recreational facilities that maintain privacy and do not mix between men and women. In general, this service is excellent.

The results of the feasibility test of the regression model based on the classification table show the readiness of tourism actors with the notated halal tourism ready category (zero), it is predicted that 13 people are not ready for halal tourism and four people who are ready for halal tourism are 76.5 per cent. Tourists ready for halal tourism are denoted (one) it is predicted that three tourists are not ready for halal tourism and 106 people are ready for halal tourism with the truth of 97.2 per cent. Overall, the percentage of the correctness of data acquisition was 94.4 per cent.

The regression model's feasibility test based on the Hosmer and Lemeshow's Goodness of Fit Test is shown by a Chi-Square value of 5.99 with a degree of freedom of 8 indicating a value of 0.05 is more significant than 0.649. This means that the logistic regression model is to be used in the logistic regression model analysis, which can explain the factors of access, communication, environment, and services that can influence the readiness of developing halal tourism.

Determination test, assessing variations in the variables of access, communication, environment, and tourism activity services, can explain variations in Halal Tourism Readiness with Nagelkerke's R Square coefficient of 0.790. This means that all the explanatory variables, namely Access, Communication, Environment, and Services, can explain their impact on the readiness of halal tourism development in Aceh Province by 79 per cent. Other variables outside the research model explain the remaining 21 per cent.

The Overall Model Fit examines the effect of access, communication, environment, and services simultaneously on tourism activities on halal tourism development. The results show that the model's significance value is smaller than the 5 per cent real level with a significant 99 per cent. This means that together the variables of Access, Communication, Environment, and Services of tourism activities affect halal tourism development in Aceh Province.

The influence of access, communication, environment, and services of halal tourism activities on halal tourism development in Aceh Province is shown by the binner logit regression coefficient in Table 1.

Tabel 1. Logistic Regressior	Results of Tourism	Actors' Readiness on	n Halal Tourism
Ι	Development in Aceb	1 Province	

Variable	Koefisien	P-value	Odds		
			Ratio		
Access (ACS)	2.559	0.013	12.921		
Communication (COM)	2.509	0.009	12.221		
Environment (ENV)	1.113	0.345	3.044		
Services (SER)	2.633	0.032	13.920		

Source: Result test using SPSS, 2020

The Table 1 shows that tourism activities in the form of access, communication, and services have a positive effect on halal tourism development in Aceh Province with a significance of 95 per cent or 5 per cent real level. Environmental activities do not affect the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province.

Access has a positive effect on the development of halal tourism. This means that each increase in access by one on the Likert scale will increase halal tourism development by 2.559 on the Likert scale. This shows that the better access to tourist destinations, the better the halal tourism development in Aceh Province. Findings of Abdulhaji, &Sina Hi (2016) also found that access affects tourism activity. Kabu (2019) states that access to tourism is essential in its role and influence on tourism activities. Besides, Edwin, Wibowo, &Shihab (2018) also found that access such as information and other facilities, directly and indirectly, impacted tourism development. The Access factor's odd ratio value is 12.921, meaning that tourism players who are ready for halal tourism have access to support for 12.921 times the development of halal tourism compared to tourist actors who are not ready for the development of halal tourism.

Communication has a positive effect on the readiness to develop halal tourism with a coefficient of 2.509. This means that each increase in communication by one on the Likert scale will increase halal tourism development by 2.509 on the Likert scale, that is, the better communication to tourist destinations, it will increase the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province. Ho and Gebsombut (2019) and Kim et al. (2017) states that communication is related to and affects tourism objects' search. Communication in the form of promotion forms an image of a destination that influences the decision to visit. Suitable promotional activities will have a positive impact on tourism development, including halal tourism.

The odds ratio value of the communication factor is 12.221, meaning that tourism actors who are ready for halal tourism have communication support of 12.221 times for halal tourism development compared to tourist actors who are not ready for the development of halal tourism.

Services have a positive effect on the readiness of developing halal tourism with a coefficient of 2.633. This means that a change in 1 on the Likert scale's tourism services will increase the development of halal tourism by 2.633 on the Likert scale. This means that the higher the quality of tourism activity services, the higher the readiness for halal tourism development in Aceh Province. The study results indicate that dimensions such as

quality of accessibility, accommodation, place and its components directly contribute to tourist satisfaction, and their intention to return and ultimately the development of the tourism industry in an area that must be considered by the managers of this industry. The service factor odd ratio value of 13,920 means that tourism actors ready for halal tourism can provide services for 13,920 times the development of halal tourism compared to tourist actors who are not ready to develop halal tourism. Finally, environmental factors do not affect, and there is little chance to determine halal tourism development in Aceh Province. Supporting this, Shafiq (2013) explains that services in tourism activities such as hotels impact visitors so that they will return to tourist destination areas.

Based on this analysis, an important finding is obtained, in which environmental factors do not affect the development of halal tourism, with a low odds ratio of 3.044. This means that the environment is not yet developed and can support the development of halal tourism that is being carried out by the local government. According to Akova&Atsiz (2019), environmental factors can take the form of socio-culture which is an interaction in society and includes changes in value systems, individual behaviour, family relationships, collective lifestyles, traditional ceremonies, and community organizations. The interaction of tourists and hosts can lead to mistrust, exploitative behaviour, and deception. Hence, it has a substantial impact on host societies from a sociocultural point of view.

Positive and beneficial tourism environmental activities include arts, crafts, traditional regional culture, and local communities' socio-cultural life. In contrast, damaging and detrimental activities can take lousy behaviour by the community in interacting with tourists. Suppose the condition of the tourism environment shows good quality. In that case, the development of tourism, especially halal tourism, can be realized. However, currently, the Aceh Province's tourism environment is still not ready to influence the development of halal tourism. It means that the tourism environmental factor still needs improvement and guidance from various parties so that in the future, it can contribute to the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province.

E. Conclussion

From the results of the research and discussion described in the previous chapter, the following conclusions were drawn:

- 1. Access, communication, environment, and tourism services simultaneously affect halal tourism development in Aceh Province.
- 2. Partially, the factors of access, communication, and tourism services have a positive effect on halal tourism development. At the same time, the environment does not affect the development of halal tourism in Aceh Province.
- 3. Of all the factors in tourism, the service factor has a high chance of determining halal tourism development in Aceh Province. In contrast, the tourism environmental factor has little chance and does not affect halal tourism development in Aceh Province.
- 4.Tourists who are ready for halal tourism have a more significant opportunity in developing halal tourism than those who are not ready for halal tourism. In general, tourists who are ready for halal tourism have a chance of 12 to 13 times compared to those who are not ready for halal tourism.

Acknowledgements

This research is funded by the Ministry of Education and Culture, based on the Lector's Research Implementation Agreement Letter for the 2020 Fiscal Year Number: 270

/ UN11 / SPK / PNBP / 2020 dated 17 March 2020. The author and team would like to thank the Institute for Research and Community Service Syiah Kuala Darussalam University Banda Aceh. Hopefully, this research can provide the most significant benefit.

Bibliography

- Abdulhaji, Sulfi & Sina Hi. Yusuf, Ibnu, (2016). Pengaruh Atraksi, Aksesibilitas, Dan Fasilitas Terhadap Citra Objek Wisata Danau Tolire Besar Di Kota Ternate. Jurnal Penelitian Humano. 7 (2), pp.134-148.
- Akova, Orhan., & Atsiz, Ozan. 2019. Sociocultural impacts of tourism development on heritage sites. The Routledge Handbook of Tourism Impacts. Publisher: Routledge
- Battour, M., Ismail .M., & Battor, M., (2010). Toward a Halal Toursm Market. Tourism Analysis. 15(4), pp. 461-470.
- Darmawan, Deni. 2013. Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Bandung: Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Edwin, S M., Wibowo, W C., & Shihab, M R. (2018). The effects of tourism information quality in shaping tourists' visiting interest. Journal of Physics: Conference Series, International Conference of Computer and Informatics Engineering, Bogor, Indonesia, 1193, pp. 1-6.
- Gelgel,I Putu (2006). Industri Pariwisata Indonesia Dalam Globalisasi Perdagangan Jasa. Bandung : PT Rfika Aditama.
- Ghozali, Imam. (2013). Aplikasi Analisis Multivarite dengan SPSS. Edisi Keempat, Semarang: Badan Penerbit Universitas Diponegoro.
- Gujarati, Damodar. (2011). Ekonometrik Dasar, Jakarta : Erlangga.
- Hasan, Haslinda. 2016. A Study On Awareness And Perception Towards Halal Foods Among Muslim Students In Kota Kinabalu, Sabah. Proceedings of the Australia-Middle East Conference on Business and Social Sciences, Dubai in partnership with The Journal of Developing Areas.
- Ho, C.-T.B., Gebsombut, N. (2019) Communication Factors Affecting Tourist Adoption of Social Network Sites. Sustainability, 11, pp. 4198.
- Jayathilake, P.M. Bandula. 2013. Tourism And Economic Growth In Sri Lanka: Evidence From Cointegration And Causality Analysis. International Journal of Business, Economics and Law. 2,(2), pp: 22-27.
- Kadir , Norsiah & Karim, Mohd Zaini Abd. 2012. Tourism and Economic Growth in Malaysia: Evidence from Tourist Arrivas from ASEAN-5 Countries. Economic Research 25(4), pp:1089-1100.
- Kementrian pariwisata.2019. https://www.kemenparekraf.go.id/post/data-kunjunganwisatawan-mancanegara-bulanan-tahun-2019.
- Keminfo. 2019. https://kominfo.go.id/content/detail/18069/5-tahun-kembangkanpariwisata-halal-indonesia-akhirnya-raih-peringkat-pertama-wisata-halal-dunia-2019/0/artikel_gpr.
- Kemenpar (2019). https://www.kemenparekraf.go.id/post/data-kunjungan-wisatawanmancanegara-bulanan-tahun-2019. accessed in January 2020
- Kominfo (2020). https://kominfo.go.id/content/detail/18069/5-tahun-kembangkanpariwisata-halal-indonesia-akhirnya-raih-peringkat-pertama-wisata-halal-dunia-2019/0/artikel_gpr, accessed in August 2020.
- Kemkeu (2019) (http://www.djpk.kemenkeu.go.id/?p=5412), accessed in July 2020.

- Kabu, Melky.(2019). Pengaruh Daya Tarik Wisata Dan Aksesibilitas Terhadap Tingkat Kunjungan Wisata Ke Desa Boti Kabupaten Timor Tengah Selatan. Jurnal Tourism. 02(01), pp, 24 – 31.
- Kim, S. E., Lee, K. Y., Shin, S. I., & Yang, S. B. (2017). Effects of Tourism Information Quality in Social Media on Destination Image Formation: the Case of Sina Weibo. Information & Management, 54(6), 687-702.
- Sekaran, U., & Bougie, R. (2016). Research methods for business: a skill-building approach (7 th ed.). Haddington: John Wiley & Sons.
- Shafiq, Yasir and Shafique, Imran and Din, Muhammad Saadat and Cheema, Khaliq Ur Rehman. (2013) Impact of Service quality on customer satisfaction: a study of hotel industry of Faisalabad, Pakistan. Published in: International Journal of Management & Organizational Studies, 1, (2), pp. 55-59.
- Spillane, J James. (1994). Pariwisata Indonesia Siasat Ekonomi dan Rekayasa Kebudayaan. Kanisius. Yogyakarta.

Sugiyono. (2013). Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D. Bandung: Alfabeta.

Suliyanto. (2009). Metode Riset Bisnis, Penerbit Andi, Yogyakarta. Edisi Ketiga, Penerbit BPFE.